

Exploitation in urban labour markets and resilience factors: Lessons from the Maasai migrant workers in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Dr. Emmanuel J. Munishi

COLLEGE OF BUSINESS EDUCATION, TANZANIA

Abstract

This paper explores labour exploitation threat and resilience factors among the Maasai migrant workers in Dar es Salaam City, Tanzania to specifically determine the migrants' capacity to cope with the threat and recommend factors for enhancing the migrants' capacities to cope with the threat. Based on the multi-layered social resilience framework the paper adopted a qualitative approach drawing on 50 migrants, 20 key informants, and 3 Focus Group Discussion (FGD); supplemented by review of secondary data. Findings revealed that labour exploitation among migrants was manifested in various forms including through low wages, overworking, involvement in multiple tasks for the same pay and forcible display of migrants' traditional values for free. Migrants also encountered delay in payments and arbitrary deduction of salaries, false accusations and victimisation, together with random job termination. Migrants drew mainly, from individual and household levels, to develop mainly reactive and to a lesser extent proactive capacities in coping with various labour exploitation threats. However, more potential could be tapped from meso, national and international levels to support the migrants to more competently cope with the threats. In this case migrants' competence against the threat could be more improved through the amelioration of their, formal skills and rendering the existing meso, national, and international institutions more responsive towards various forms of labour exploitation threats.

Key words: *urban labour market exploitation, coping strategies, resilience*

I: Introduction

Rapid urbanisation is taking place worldwide mainly due to natural population increase 60%, urban migration 40% as well as the reclassification of rural and per-urban areas into cities and towns {Potts 2013 #86}{UN-DESA 2012 #26}. Consequently, around 60% of the world's population is expected to be living in urban areas by the year 2030 {UN-HABITAT 2014 #1}. Sub-saharan Africa (SSA) is urbanising at 3.6 percent and its levels of population are set to double or triple in the next 40 years. In Tanzania, approximately 35 percent of the 42 million people had already moved into urban areas by 2008. Dar es Salaam city has been ranked the fastest growing in sub-Saharan Africa owing to its growth rate of 5.6 {URT 2011 #28}{UN-HABITAT 2014 #1}.

Urbanisation has caused among other things unemployment and proliferation of informal sector activities that the marginalised groups such as the migrants undertake to sustain their livelihoods. While informal sector development has been associated with urban economic growth notably, trade stimulation, investments and social services {Hove 2013 #24}, it's also criticised for causing a number of urban threats. An important threat associated with informal sector is labour exploitation {ILO 2009

#74}. Informal sector employment mainly absorbs the urban poor, unskilled or semi-skilled labour, and the marginalised individuals from the rural areas who are characterised by weak labour market positions, thus engaged in insecure and poorly paid jobs {ODI 2008 #70} {ILO 2013 #76}.

However, the specific nature of exploitation experienced by the internal “poor and marginalised migrant workers” and their capacities to cope with the threat has not received the deserved research attention. Most research seems to have focused on the international migrants overlooking the internal migrants even though they also face risks of labour exploitation including unfair recruitment practices just like the international labour migrants ones {ILO 2013 #76}.

The Maasaipastoralist migrants provide a classic example of the marginalised, unskilled labourers in the urban informal sector of Tanzania. The Maasai originate in the North-Eastern Tanzania and started migrating to urban areas in large scale in 1990s for wage labour due to poverty intensification resulting from decline of cattle economy and unpredictable climatic variability as well as loss of land to investments {URT 2011 #28}{Fratkin 2001 #5}. While in 2007 nearly 5000 to 6000 Maasai pastoralists were migrating to Dar es Salaam city {May 2007 #15}, in 2012, around 8000 to 9000 Maasai migrants were estimated to be present in Kinondoni District, Dar es Salaam alone {Riley 2012 #3}.

Maasai migrants have experienced historical social, economic, political and environmental marginalisation {Munishi 2013 #25} that are considered to have denied them a number of important livelihood entitlements essential for coping with the labour exploitation threats {Kweka 2011 #12}{May 2007 #15}. Economically, Maasai have lost massive chunks of land to conservation and countless number of cattle to draught and diseases. Socially, Maasai have been denied social amenities such as education, clean water, and road infrastructure mainly due to their semi-nomadic culture that did not allow them to practice sedentary life but also due to lopsided institutions that did not take into account the needs of the special social groups like the Maasai {Goldman 2007 #87}{Munishi 2013 #25}. On the political grounds Maasai society has been denied equal and meaningful political representation {Ole Kaunga 2007 #19}.

Though not exhaustive enough, considerable research on migration and urbanisation has focused on the nature of labour exploitation threats experienced by the urban migrants giving less emphasis on how migrants cope with it, their capacity to cope and how better can the migrants capacities be built to more competently cope with various forms of labour exploitation {ILO 2009 #74}. Specifically, this research has inadequately paid attention to urban indigenous groups like the Maasai {Munishi 2013 #25}.

One of the most critical forms of labour exploitation threat experienced by urban migrants is low wages as manifested among young urban migrants in Ghanaian cities {Kwankye 2007 #72}, and female urban migrants serving as bar maids in urban Tanzania who received either meagre wages, or no wages at all {Mbonile 1996 #73}. In order to cope with low payment, rural urban-migrants in Dar es Salaam engaged in supplementary activities such as shoe repair, urban farming, furniture making and operating small kiosks, food vending, local beer brewing and hair braiding {Mbonile 1996 #73}.

Moreover, in Kenya and Tanzania the Turkana and Maasai migrants experienced false accusation and delay of wages by their employers {Riley 2012 #3}{Ole Kaunga 2007 #19}{Kipuri 2010 #11}. In extreme

instances migrant workers in South African Republic were beaten, badly fed, poorly paid and subjected to sexual slavery, while some young migrants involved in human trafficking in Tanzania were denied food and freedom of movement {ACP 2010 #75}.

Basically, the foregoing literature has managed to somehow capture various forms of urban labour exploitation threat experienced the urban migrants but failing to systematically underscore how the migrants, cope with the threat, their capacities to cope and ways in which the capacities of migrants can be enhanced to more competently cope with the threats (resilience). Subsequently, this paper aims to examine labour exploitation threat experienced by the Maasai migrant workers in Dar es Salaam, Tanzania to determine the migrants' capacity to cope with the threats and recommend factors for enhancing their capacities to more competently cope with the threats.

Theoretical and conceptual framework

In order to more analytically respond to the above identified gap, this paper is guided by the multi-layered social resilience framework of {Obrist 2010 #37}. Applying this framework in the context of the current paper, social resilience is regarded as 'social actors' capacities to draw capitals from different social layers to not only cope with and adjust to informal sector-related threats "**reactive capacities**" but also search for and create options "**proactive capacities**" and thus develop increased competence in coping with the threats.

This framework borrows heavily from ecological {Carpenter 2001 #48}{Holling 1973 #50}, psychological {Luthar 2003 #52}{Masten 2001 #53} and socio-anthropological approaches {Bourdieu 1986 #43}{Bourdieu 1984 #40} as well as from the sustainable livelihoods framework of the UK Department for International Development {DfID 2000 #44}. Resilience is a normative term or process, connoting that it means different things to different people and environment thus also differently operationalised {Obrist 2010 #37}. Consequently, "the exercise of measuring resilience is highly variable, depending on the understanding and weight given to concepts such as coping, capacity, vulnerability and adaptive capacity" {Mitchell 2012 #77}.

This framework therefore purports that resilience building must be examined with reference to a threat and to the competencies that should be developed to deal with the particular threat. Depending on the threat under examination, different social fields emerge, each of them consisting of a network of actors across various layers of society. These individual, social and societal actors can build resilience by strengthening reactive and proactive capacities to deal more competently with the threat. To strengthen their capacities, actors can draw on and transform economic, social and cultural capitals and thus increase symbolic capital [power]. The ability to mobilise capitals varies according to actors' position [power] in the social field {Obrist 2010 #37: 289}.



Fig. 1: The analytical framework of the paper based on the multi-layered social resilience framework {Obrist 2010 #37}.

It is important to note that **'Reactive'** capacities are direct reactions towards a threat that is taking place or just took place while **'Proactive'** capacities are understood as abilities/initiatives such as anticipating threats, changing rules and regulations, creating new options, planning ahead, and recognizing danger {Obrist 2010 #37}. It means to **create options and responses** in order to reduce or prevent a threat that might occur again preferably in the future {Giddens 1984 #39}.

Capacities enable social actors to cope with and adjust to adverse conditions ('reactive'), and subsequently create options and responses ('proactive') necessary to increase competence, and thus create pathways for mitigating adversity or threat (s){Giddens 1984 #39}. According to {Giddens 1979 #38}, the pro-active capacity to reflect, discuss and learn from past experience is an important dimension of human agency. In contexts of adversity, positive adjustment based on a learning process is an essential dimension of resilience and leads to increased competence in dealing with challenging livelihood conditions such as labour exploitation threat being examined in this paper.

This framework is useful in several ways. Firstly, it recognises capitals notably social, economic, cultural and symbolic capitals as prerequisites for resilience building processes. Secondly, the framework recognises threats or barriers to resilience. In this case it draws the researchers' attention to question "resilience to what threat" and secondly "what particular threat or risk is being examined"? {Obrist 2010 #37: 280}. Thirdly, the framework views resilience building as a multi-layered process that involves social networks ranging from individual, household, community, meso, national and international levels {Glavovic 2003 #35}. Fourthly, the framework is strength oriented, meaning that it directs attention to actors' personal strengths and support emanating from institutions surrounding them. Indeed it considers resilience in terms of structuration process, meaning that an actor structures resilience from society and society structures resilience of an actor. Lastly, resilience thinking can provide researchers and policy-makers with solution-oriented way of thinking about populations at risk, qualifying it to be a mitigation oriented framework {Dongus 2010 #54}{Obrist 2010 #37}. These aspects are useful in this

paper as it suggests remedial measures for enhancing the migrant workers' resilience to labour exploitation threat.

Based on the above stated framework, the aim of this paper is to examine labour exploitation threat encountered by the Maasai migrant workers, to capture the migrants' capacities to cope with these threats. This examination will subsequently facilitate the production of much better ways of strengthening migrants' capacities to more competently cope with labour exploitation threat.

II: Research methodology

Research site

This research took place in Dar es Salaam the largest city in Tanzania with the population of almost three million people with an area of 1,800 Sq Km {United Nations 2014 #29}. The city is located between latitudes 6.36 degrees and 7.0 degrees to the south of Equator and longitudes 39.0 and 33.33 to the East of Greenwich. It is bounded by the Indian Ocean on the east and by the Coast Region on the other sides. Dar es Salaam has three municipalities namely, Temeke, Kinondoni and Ilala. Temeke Municipality has the largest surface area followed by Kinondoni, while Ilala has the smallest surface area {United Nations 2014 #29}.

Dar es Salaam city was considered suitable for this study owing to its current high rates of urbanisation, as well as being a city that has attracted migrants from all over Tanzania, including the Maasai migrants {Kweka 2011 #12}{World Bank 2011 #32}. Specifically, the rapid urbanisation process in Dar es Salaam has mainly been associated with threats such as higher commodity prices, unemployment, inadequate shelter and increase in crime rates {World Bank 2013 #30} {URT 2011 #28}. Therefore, it was deemed interesting to explore specific labour exploitation threats likely to be encountered by the Maasai migrant youth, as well as their capacities to cope with such threats.

III: Methods

This study employed a qualitative approach whereby a total of 64 in-depth interviews including 50 Maasai migrants and 14 key informants were conducted. Moreover, around 3 focus group discussions (FGD) were held with the Maasai migrants in Dar es Salaam while a number of observations and considerable review of secondary data were carried out. While the migrant workers were selected purposely based on the snowball sampling a great care was taken to ensure that a representative sample was selected from the three districts of Dar es Salaam namely Kinondoni, Ilala and Temeke. The respondents of the key informant interviews were chosen purposefully based on their knowledge and interest in the topic.

Table 2: Respondents and levels of interviews and FGDs

Levels of respondents in Dar es Salaam	Kinondoni	Ilala	Temeke	Sub-total
District level: District Councillor (DC)	1	-	-	1
Division level: Division Executive Officer (DEOs)	1	-	-	1
Ward level: Ward Executive Officer (WEOs)	1	1	1	3
Mtaa/Street level: Street Executive Officer (SEOs)	1	1	-	2
Meso Level : NGOs/ CBOS/ FBOs officials	1	1	1	3
Community level: Maasai elders / employers	2	1	1	4
Individual/ household level: Maasai migrants	20	15	15	50
	1 FGD	1 FGD	1 FGD	3 FGDs
GRAND TOTAL	-	-	-	64

Source: Field data (2011)

Initially, this study aimed at including both male and female migrants, however, during data collection it became clear that it is mainly the men who migrate. Only three young female migrants could be traced. Maasai women usually get married at young age and are traditionally responsible for raising the kids and taking care of the livestock {National Museum of Tanzania 2004 #17}.

The field team consisted of a researcher himself and two assistants who were graduate students, proficient in Maasai, Kiswahili and English languages but also well trained in qualitative research interview skills. All Interviews were carried out in Maa (*kimaasai*) and Kiswahili, recorded in audio tapes and later on transcribed and also translated into English.

Interviews with most Government and NGOs officials took place in their offices, while discussion with Maasai employers and elders took place either in their home residences or at work places. In any case calm environment and privacy was maintained at the maximum. Importantly, Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) were conducted in very convenient venues that were easily accessible to all the participants and comfortable to express themselves. The Swahili transcriptions were translated into English by the facilitators. Content analysis of the typed English, transcriptions was done in MAXQDA 10 [VERBI Software, Marburg, Germany]. Data was grouped accordingly; codes were generated, leading to categories and themes.

Findings and discussion

Informal activities performed by the Maasai migrant workers

It was noted that majority of the Maasai migrant workers in cities engaged in more than one income earning activities and so the percentages do not add up to 100%, but are calculated based on how many

people gave that answer. The responses are summarised in the table below and there after explained in details after the table.

Table 2: Summary of where in urban areas the urban migrants sale labour

Security guards	Hair dressing	Petty trade	Construction & Domestic work	Multiple income earning activities
75%	43%	24%	8%	75%

As can be seen in the above table, around 75 percent (n=100) of Maasai the migrant youth in Dar es Salaam city confirmed having worked as security guards to generate income. They undertook this work during the day or night time, on either a part-time or a full-time basis. They provided this service in private places such as families, as well as public places such as construction sites, car parks, motorcar garages and yards, churches, schools, health facilities, bars and hotels. In 2006, {Coast 2006 #47: 2} noted that around 90 percent of the Maasai pastoralists in Arusha city, North-Eastern Tanzania also worked as guards (*askaris*).

Moreover, around 43% (n=100) of the interviewed migrants engaged in **Maasai traditional hair dressing activity**, either on a full- or part time basis as a way of earning income. Firstly, migrants carried out this activity in partnership with the *Waswahili* (non-Maasai), the majority of whom were the hair dressing saloon owners. In this case, a *Mswahili* owning a hair dressing saloon hires a Maasai who can work for him or her on permanent or part-time basis. Secondly, Maasai migrants carried out the hair dressing activity independently by negotiating with customers in terms of the price and a convenient place where the activity could be carried out¹. In such a case, either a Maasai migrant moved to the customer's place or a customer moved to a Maasai place of choice. Thirdly, some migrants opened a hair dressing salon either as individuals or a group. It was noted that around 4 Maasai migrant youth had been operating hair dressing saloons individually or in groups with other Maasai youth.

Furthermore, around 24% (n=100) of the interviewed Maasai migrant youth **traded on various articles**, including, human and livestock medicine, Maasai traditional clothing, beads, shoes, handbags and belts.² Maasai migrants selling these items walked around the city as hawkers, stationing themselves in some strategic places such as bus stands and road reserves, as well as public places such as bars and hotels. Some 8% (n=100) of the Maasai migrant youths **sold labour in domestic and construction work**; meaning that they worked as houseboys and [girls], as well as supplying labour in places where roads and house construction were taking place. Domestic activities performed by the migrants mainly involved cleaning, grazing and milking cows, as observed in the outskirts of Dar es Salaam city, notably in Kimara, Mbezi, Kibaha, Pugu, Tegeta and Bunju. Interviews with some household representatives in

¹In some cases some Maasai migrants performed the hair dressing job at the same time as they were engaged in other activities such as working as security guard or selling traditional items such as herbs.

²Maasai local herbs are highly preferred by the Maasai living in the city but also the other city residents as they are said to cure a number of ailments, which include stomach-ache, fever, and human fertility-related problems.

Ngorongoro District also revealed that 6 migrants engaged in grazing and milking livestock for pay in Arusha, Dar es Salaam and Mwanza cities, in Tanzania and Kisumu city in Kenya, while 2 migrants sold labour in construction work, notably assisting in building roads and houses, in Moshi and Dar es Salaam cities, respectively.

It was further noted that around 75% (n=100) of the migrants engaged in **multiple income earning activities**, meaning that they performed more than one of the aforementioned livelihood activities. In such cases, some migrant workers simultaneously engaged in working as security guards and selling herbs or hairdressing.

Forms of labour exploitation threats experienced by migrant workers

The most critical threat experienced by the migrant workers in Dar es Salaam was low wages that did not at all reflect their labour returns, subsequently, subjecting them to acute financial constraints. Examination of the migrants' earnings, were found to be as shown in the table below³.

Table 3: Maasai migrants' monthly financial earnings

Earnings' categories	Frequency	Percent	Cumulative Percent
15-25 (€)	12	24.0	24.0
26-50 (€)	14	28.0	52.0
51-74 (€)	16	32.0	84.0
75-Above (€)	8	16.6	100.0
Total	50	100.0	100.0

Source: Field data (2011)

As can be observed in the above table, the majority of the migrants earned between Tsh 30,000 and 150,000/= (equivalent to **Euro 15-75**) per month. However, none of the migrants earned less than 15 Euros, while around 16 percent received over 75 Euros. This information slightly corroborates with other existing studies. {Ole Kaunga 2002 #18: 4} observed a monthly income of between Tsh 30,000/= and 70,000/= (equivalent to **Euro 15-35**), while recently, {Kweka 2011 #12: 3} reported an average monthly income of only Tsh 30,000/= (**Euro 15**) among the Maasai migrants.

Critical reasons for low wages among the migrants is lack of formal and employability skills, little knowledge of the market situation in the urban areas, low bargaining power and skills, together with the poverty situation the migrants found themselves in, as testified here under:

I do almost the whole work at the hairdressing saloon but my boss [employer] pays me too little. But, I think the reasons for the low payments is due to the truth that I don't have my own hair dressing saloon where I can independently do this work and determine prices by myself. At the moment, she [employer] pays me Tsh5000-10,000 per head depending on the hair dressing style. Yet, the work may take me more than one day, and to my knowledge, she receives up to Tsh 50,000 and even more per one head. If I had my own saloon, I would be earning all this money for myself. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (27), Dar es Salaam)**

³ This computation has included both financial and non-financial earnings. However Most of the migrants ended up taking home between 5-50 Euros due to arbitrary deductions and delays of their monthly salaries. See the following chapter on exploitation and oppression threats.

Another threat experienced by the migrants is the migrant's involvement in various activities for the same payas evidenced in the following testimonies:

Most of the Maasai [youth] employed as security guards are required by their bosses [employers] to also do some other works. When a Maasai is serving as a security guard at big shops, groceries or in bars he may without extra pay be responsible for loading and unloading sacks of rice, crates of beer and sodas and even performing cleanness without their conceit. That is undeniable fact! **(Female businessperson and Maasai employer (42), Mwenge-Dar esSalaam)**

Migrants also experienced forcible display of traditional values and photo taking with visitors. This happened among the Maasai migrants working mainly in the tourism sector as explained by one of them below.

These visitors [mainly whites] come to us and request us to have photos with them and sing and dance our traditional dances for them. Visitors come to us as if it is their own move, but we have discovered that it is the boss [our employer] who directs them to us. In fact we have also found out that dancing and singing our traditional dances for the visitors is officially stipulatedas one of the beach's offers and advertised by the beach management as one of the services that visitors should expect [entitled] to get once they are here. But this has not been explicitly communicated to us. We should have been informed about it! **(Male Maasai migrant youth (32), Dar es Salaam)**

Another threat experienced by the migrants was arbitrary salary deductions. Maasai employers deducted Maasai salaries for different unlawful and unjustifiable reasons. Firstly, migrants salaries' were unfairly deducted to pay for some items that went missing at work places for the simple argument that migrants were allegedly directly or indirectly responsible for their disappearance of the items as attested below.

Another problem is the fact that, at times things may be stolen at work place and my boss wants me to pay them, (...) he simply deducts it from my salary and this retards my development plans as my targets may not be reached [because of deductions]. **(Male Maasai youth migrant (26), Dar es Salaam)**

(At times things get lost or stolen at work place and I have to pay them. You see, the fact is that even if I resist paying them, my boss will deduct it from my salary anyway. (...) And in most cases he will obviously do so against my will though" **(Male Maasai youth migrant (32), Dar es Salaam)**

.... He also told us that he could not send us anything [financial support] because some property got lost at the shop where he was formerly working as a security guard and his boss falsely held him responsible for it, (...) and so he was imprisoned. But, later on, the actual victims were found out and he was released from the prison. He was not compensated anything by the boss [employer] **(Male household representative (43) Ngorongoro Arusha)**

Migrants also received their salaries later than usual due to less than convincing reasons. The intensity of this threat is as noted below:

(...) they don't really pay them on time [the Maasai]. However, they tell them that oh! We are very sorry about it and may be next time I will consider paying the full amount. So economically, they do not really benefit a lot from working as security guards. They only get what the Swahili people call "kifutiamachosi" [it means very little payment compared to the amount of service they offer"]. **(Male Maasai elder (52), Dar es Salaam)**

He told us that the company pays him around 170,000/- per month, but then, he was complaining that at times it takes too long for him to receive his salary (...). Last time he called us and said that they had not paid him for almost two months and he was depending on his friends for a living (**Female household representative (51), Loliondo Division - Ngorongoro**)

Secondary data also confirms that Maasai migrants' payments were over-delayed by their employers without genuine justifications, partly due to having entered mutual agreements with their bosses, which were in most cases to the advantage of their employers. Consequently, Maasai were more often than not at the mercy of their employers, who would subsequently pay salaries at their convenience {Ole Kaunga 2002 #18}.

Migrants were also confronted with false allegations, accusations and victimization by their employers as attested by 46 percent (n=50) of the respondents. These accusations were mainly related to lost property or stealing from work⁴. The accusations costed the Maasai migrants dearly both in terms of financial and time resources, as stated by this male migrant:

I think exploitation will never go away from us. For example, when my boss noticed that I had bought the motorcycle he simply concluded that I had stolen from him and so he reduced my salary from Tsh 120, 000 to Tsh 90,000". This has been a big blow to me as it sounds like working for the benefit of other people and not realizing my own dreams. (**Male Maasai youth migrant (31), Dar es Salaam**)

... He also told us that he could not send us anything because some property got lost at the shop where he was formerly working as a security guard and his boss falsely held him responsible for it, and so he was imprisoned. Nevertheless, later on, the actual victims were found out and he was released from the prison. He was not compensated anything by his boss [employer]. He then decided to look for another work. (**Household Representative, Male (43) Ngorongoro Arusha**).

These findings are supported by other former studies justifying that Maasai migrant workers would be implicated with frauds that even took place at the work place on the days when they were not on duty {Riley 2012 #3}. Moreover, migrants would be harassed and humiliated by police and their job contracts terminated without being given an opportunity to defend themselves {Ole Kaunga 2007 #19}.

Migrants were also confronted with the problem of arbitrary job termination. This means that the migrants were kicked out of jobs as it pleased their employers mainly in connection with the disappearance of some items, or not showing up for work due to genuine reasons such as being sick, etc. This even occurred in instances where the migrants were not at all responsible for such faults. This consequently forced migrants to survive under extremely challenging economic situations, as attested by one of them:

What I am experiencing is simply mistreatment because, as I have told you, the *mzungu* [a white employer] chased me away simply because of one day mistake which I even committed it for the first time, (...). I also used to receive my salary very late which was at the same time very little. Tsh 50,000 [the monthly salary he

⁴ Generally, Maasai are believed to be faithful and diligent in discharging their responsibilities, more especially working as security guards; and this is certainly one of the reasons why they are increasingly recruited and employed for the same. Dealing with the issue of the Maasai being considered unfaithful [steal at work place] as a negative case the researcher found out that most of the Maasai were innocent of this situation, and they were therefore fixed in such traps by their non-Maasai co-workers or their employers who were not willing to pay them.

receives] is not enough to keep someone here in the city, because life is very hard. **(Male Maasai youth migrant (27), Dar es Salaam)**

Another form of labour exploitation experienced by the migrants was denial of their job contracts. This happened because firstly, the migrants were ignorant of their right to job contracts. For instance, most of the migrants did not understand that a lack of job contracts would among other things jeopardise their employment rights, as portrayed by one of the migrants below:

I understand that having a contract will help me acquire my final employment benefits such as my pension. But the pension is nothing, I can deposit it [money] in a bank by myself and get it when I need it, (...) what is a pension after all? Benefits or pension are both money and I can have that money from friends or relatives once I need it and deposit it in a bank by myself, in case I need to do so. **(Male Maasai Migrant youth (27), Dar es Salaam)**

Secondly, employers claimed that Maasai were working as casual and extremely mobile labours [*vibarua*] who did not truly deserve contracts:

“The boss [employer] does not want to give us the job contract because he knows that we can leave at any time and so if he gives us the contract it is going to be a kind of disturbance. If you remind him about it he becomes very bitter with you” **(Male Maasai migrant youth (24), Dar es Salaam)**

Thirdly, employers preferred not to enter formal contracts with the Maasai workers in order to avoid paying them other job-related benefits on top of their salaries, as required by the labour laws in Tanzania.⁵ A migrant summarises this below:

You ask me why I do not have a [job] contract. Employers want to use us as much as they wish, without even caring about our rights. I have consistently asked for this thing [formal contract], but I have not really managed to receive it from him [employer]. May be they despise us because we have not been to school” **(Male Maasai migrant youth (28), Dar es Salaam)**

Fourthly, migrants’ employers took advantage of the Maasai’ illiteracy, particularly their lack of labour law knowledge and bargaining skills due to lack of Kiswahili language proficiency.

“...most of the employers may not be willing to provide job contracts as they want to take advantage of the Maasai not having contracts to exploit them. Now the second thing is that if you demand for it he will simply threaten to take you to court or call in a police officer”. **(Male educated Maasai elder (65), Dar es Salaam)**

Secondary data also confirms that Maasai migrant workers in urban centres did not have legitimate contracts as required by the Tanzanian labour law, mainly due to a lack of knowledge about it. Consequently, employers took liberties and played tricks by taking advantage of the cultural shock that severely hits the Maasai upon their initial arrival in the new city {Ole Kaunga 2002 #18}{LHRC 2011 #69}

Table 4: Forms of labour exploitation threats facing migrant workers

Threat	%
--------	---

⁵ Discussion based on observations but also personal telephone and e-mail communication with key informants, labour law experts

Low wages subjecting migrants to financial constraints	76%
Salary/wages delays	50%
Arbitrary salary deductions	54%
Involvement in various activities for the same pay	34%
Forcible display of traditional values and photo taking with visitors	24%
false allegations, accusations and victimisation by employers	46 %
Arbitrary job termination	34%
Denial of job contracts	56%
	N= 100

Source: Field data (2011)

Factors determining migrants' capacities to cope with labour exploitation threat

Building on the multi-layered social resilience framework {Obrist 2010 #37}, in this section I describe factors that either lead to or constrained the migrants' competencies in coping with labour exploitation threat among the migrant workers. In the context of this paper I differentiate between "reactive as well as proactive capacities that the migrants managed to develop at different social layers notably individual, households, community, national and international levels to cope with labour exploitation threat. Individual layer results from the migrants' struggles at the personal level, households' level support comes from the migrants' households both in the sending and urban areas. National level support comes from both the local and central government institutions and structures such as the police, government offices and policies, whereas the international level support is basically represented by the international organisations and institutions.

I: Coping with and adjusting to labour exploitation threat (*reactive capacities*)

At individual level an important reactive capacity of coping with low wages by the migrants was the migrants' ability to engage in multiple income earning activities as attested by 75% and the testimonies below:

I work as a watchman, but during my free time in the afternoon I engage myself in hair dressing business. I also sell some Maasai traditional herbs and tobacco. At times I can get a tender of supplying Maasai traditional sandals and I do it immediately. I have to do all these in order to survive in the city [boast financial capacity]. Otherwise I may end up begging here. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (29) Dar es Salaam)**

...He works [a migrant] day and night without a break in between. He works as night security guard in one of the local schools here. (...) But in the morning he is responsible for washing pupil's dishes. (...) In the afternoon he works as a gate keeper and a messenger whereas, in the evening he is responsible for cleaning the classrooms after the students have left the school. (...) He [migrant] spends a night with his family [wife and child] at work place when working as a night security guard. **(Male key informant (36), Dar es Salaam)**

Moreover, around 46 percent (n=50) of the migrants spent less money on the less important needs as well as opting for cheap groceries and shopping places. Indeed, rather than buying expensive clothes, migrants relied on their traditional clothing, namely *rubbega* and *traditional sandals* made out of old car tyres.

Look here! We [Maasai] wear simple shoes [as you can see] made out of car tyres. We wear it every day. And unlike the *Waswahili* [noon Maasai] we can wear them all year long. We wear our simple *rubbega*

[Maasai traditional garment also known as *(Shukas)*. We need only two or three pairs [of them] are enough for us. Unlike the *Waswahili* we can hardly visit or spend money on fashion shops and so on. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (30), Dar es Salaam)**

Still at the individual level, migrants constantly bargained and negotiated with employers pertaining fair and timely remuneration, arbitrary job termination, delay and deduction of salaries. However, when this strategy could not work out migrants quitted jobs and looked for new ones.

In many cases the *Waswahili*[non-Maasai employers] will expect you to look for them because they know that you are the one with a problem [financial need]. So since we are in-need we have to look for them [employers]. So we always chase for them and when we don't get them we change strategies. (...)Yes we became furious to the boss or even give up the job**(Male Migrant youth (28), Dar es Salaam)**

My first job here was working as a security guard, but I quitted it because my boss was not fair to me (...) [why?]Because my boss could say that I was a thief, stealing from him something that I had not done. Then I decided to leave the job so that I could avoid unnecessary quarrels with him [the employer]. **(Maasai youth migrant (28), Dar es Salaam)**

Furthermore, migrants demonstrated aspects of their exotic culture in discharging their duties as a strategy of coping with exploitation threat. Such aspects included dressing in traditional regalia, singing and dancing the Maasai traditional songs while on duty that subsequently enabled the migrants secure employment in security and hospitality establishments such as hotels and restaurants. This was further proved by the fact that, employers required the Maasai migrants working as security guards, attendants or receptionists in their organisations to behave in their traditionally colourful manner as a way of attracting and entertaining visitors.

At the household level migrants coped with labour exploitation threat by drawing on the households' resources such as livestock, land and agricultural products to alleviate the threats. Financial and non-financial wealth resulting from these resources helped migrants supplement low wages as attested below:

(...) Off course, how could I have come to the city without something in the pocket? I sold two of my bulls and used the money for both travelling [bus fare] to Dar es Salaam and survived [buy food] on the first days. You see, even if you are to depend on your friends you also need to have something of your own in the pocket as a backup in case the situation becomes unbearable.**(Male Maasai migrant youth (30) Dar es Salaam)**

I don't have to depend on the salary all the year around. After all, the salary is too small to sustain me here in the city. So from time to time I return to my home village where I can either seek more money [engagement in pastoralism and agriculture] to improve my income and survive in the city. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (31), Dar es Salaam)**

At the community level, migrants coped with low wages and its related financial constraints through sharing resources such as accommodation owing to the strong social networks that existed among them as the Maasai.

In most cases we sleep where we work; and as you know we are usually invited by our friends working in those places. We spend nights at their places of work when they are on night duties and when we happen to be on night duty, we too invite them [our colleagues] to come and secure shelter. In this way we cannot run shortage of shelter [somewhere to spend a night] **(Male Maasai migrant youth (27), Dar es Salaam)**

Still at community level migrants coped with low wages by turning to employers for financial support as evidenced by 34percent (n=50) of the migrants. Kind of support secured from employers by the migrant workers included loans and advance salaries once confronted with abrupt and pressing financial problems such as a family member falling sick, paying fees for children and other emergencies. The borrowed money would be deducted from the migrants' salary in the subsequent months. This helped the migrants to solve their financial problems on time, as stated below.

When I need more money I can simply talk to my employer and he can give me my salary in advance. But when the problem is too urgent and pressing and my salary is not enough, I would talk to my boss to lend me some amount of money and then I can pay him slowly. I have been doing this whenever I need to pay big amount of money such as paying my children's school fee **(Male Maasai Youth migrant (32), Dar es Salaam)[reactive capacity]**

At meso level the migrants coped with low wages by collectively engaging in different cultural activities e.g. traditional dances for entertainment and fundraising purposes. This was thanks to the strong social networks that existed among the migrants. In most cases, people interested in these dances donated some money to migrants, thus enhancing the migrants' financial security.

Another important reactive capacity of coping with low wages at the Meso level was the migrants' ability to form and draw support on their solidarity organisations. Indeed, around 28percent (n=50) of the migrants attested to having turned to their existing formal or informal solidarity groups for financial, employment or shelter support in the city. Financially, speaking, these organisations supported their members through transport services on occasions such as death and illness, as well as start-up capital for members who sought to start a business. In the case of supporting a business, the financial support was given out either for free or as a loan, depending on the status of the person requesting support and the amount involved.

We insist that Maasai living in the city must unite and support each other. We meet to discuss problems [including financial ones] that are facing us and how to overcome them here in the city. In case someone finds life unbearable we can assist him; for example we must contribute some money and support one of us who happens to fall sick or has lost a relative. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (31), Dar es Salaam)**

Our unions are helpful in many ways. When one of us has entered into a problem lets' say into serious confrontation with the employer [boss]. For example, it could be that the boss has accused him of stealing or damage at work, we quickly contribute some money and transport him to the village and he should stay there until the storm is over, or his boss completely forgets about it. **(Male Maasai youth migrant (25), Dar es Salaam)**

Last but not least, another reactive capacity developed by the migrants in coping with exploitation and oppression threat at the community level was collective and continuous bargaining of good remuneration with their employers. This was alsomainly thanks to strong social networks that existed among the migrants. In this case migrants firstly collectively organised amicable talks with employers to solve issues related to inadequate payment, job termination, delay and deductions of salaries etc. When this strategy failed they employed more harsh strategies such as engaging in demonstration and distraction of property.

III: Searching for, learning from and creating options to deal with threats (proactive capacities)

Proactively, migrants recognised the need to further invest in their cultural values as a sustainable future way of coping with the threats. Such aspects included wearing of Maasai traditional attire, carrying of traditional weapons such as swords, spears, arrows and keeping their hair traditional as strategies of distinguishing themselves from the rest of city dwellers and as the unique elements that were always required by the employers. This subsequently, added to the migrants' chances of getting recognition and employment and thus becoming more financially secure.

We know that we cannot compete with our non Maasai counterparts in terms of securing employment opportunities [and maintain financial security]. But, we are certain of one thing "our traditional values are very unique and highly appreciated by most employers. So the best thing is to capitalise on them [traditional values] as the only thing that can help us have some food on the table [gain salary and day to day financially related needs]. **(Male migrant's employer (35) Dar es Salaam)**

Maasai simply respect themselves. Moreover, they are so faithful in carrying out their jobs. Maasai don't sleep at night and they will not steal or spoil anything at work place. So that is why most of the people [employers] go for them. On the other hand when you employ other people they might be expensive to maintain and they may end up not being careful at work as they may steal or sleep and let the thieves' in. **(Male migrant's employer (45) Dar es Salaam)**

Moreover of migrant workers learned the potential of and thus invested on household assets notably livestock and agricultural production as a more sustainable future way of becoming more financially stable and overcome low wage as evidenced by around 75 percent (n=50) of the migrants:

...my plans are to buy more cows, keep them in the village so that when they grow very fat, I can sell them at [relatively] much higher price and get some money, to invest in my children's education. Then, I will do away with this business [working as security guard a kind of job that is less paying]. As you know cows [cattle] is everything among us [we the Maasai]. **(Male Maasai migrant youth, Dar es Salaam)**

At the moment, I am struggling to save some money and invest it in the vegetable production. I think farming onions in my village may pay quite well. And this I think should be a good strategy towards saying bye-bye to poverty [financial and unemployment threats]. Here we work from morning to evening [as security guards] but we don't see any progress [good income] **(Male Maasai migrant youth, (29), Dar es Salaam)**

At meso level, migrant workers reinforced unity among themselves having learned and recognised it as viable option of coping with low wages and financial constraints. Around 28 percent (n=50) of the migrants attested to have turned to their existing formal or informal solidarity groups for financial support. These organisations supported their members through transport services on occasions such as illness, death of their loved ones as well as start-up capital for members who sought to start business.

Now we understand the importance of unity among ourselves. So we insist that Maasai living in the city must unite and support each other. We meet to discuss problems [including financial ones] that are facing us and how to overcome them here in the city. In case someone finds life unbearable we can assist him; for example we must contribute some money and support one of us who happens to fall sick or has lost a relative. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (31), Dar es Salaam)[Reactive capacity]**

Some secondary data also acknowledges the presence of the Maasai migrant solidarity groups popularly known as *Oloips*, whereby some Maasai migrants met to socialise with their age mates, exchange news,

discuss problems and play games, as well as supporting each other financially {Ole Kaunga 2002 #18}{May 2003 #14}.

Furthermore, migrants recognised the importance of investing in various entrepreneurship activities as future way of coping with labour exploitation threat. Such activities included hair dressing, trading on local human and livestock medicine, handcrafts and other retail business to counteract low wages and its related financial, constraints.

I wanted to become more economically independent so I want to invest the money in opening my own hair dressing saloon. I need to have my own customers, because at the moment I have to get the customers through my boss [employer] at the Y2K saloon and she has to deduct some percent from my money, let's say per every customer ..., which is somehow exploitative for me. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (27) Dar es Salaam)**

Moreover around 60 percent (n=50) of the migrants invested in learning Kiswahili language and intended to invest in their own and their children's education. Migrants also considered this ability as effective in coping with low wages and financial constraints.

You know, we are suffering [don't have good income] because we simply lack education, we cannot read even a newspaper to find a jobs inside there. Employers would be happy to see that [employ people who can read and write] (...) so I am not read to see my child falling a victim of this same situation [not having education]. It is important to give education to my child. (...) so I am working hard to save enough [money] for taking my child to school. **(Male Maasai Migrant youth (31) Dar es Salaam)**

Factors inhibiting coping capacities

Even though the migrants managed to develop reactive as well as proactive capacities of coping with labour exploitation threat as discussed above, they also faced certain constraints that impeded their capacities of coping with the threat, right from individual to international levels as discussed below.

Firstly, migrants failed to successfully cope with labour exploitation threat due to communication barrier notably lack of Kiswahili language proficiency even though this is the national and business language in Tanzania. This threat rendered the migrants incapable of effectively communicating with customers thus jeopardised their various economic activities as evidenced by one of them.

(...) Some Maasai [migrants] in Dar es Salaam are good at bargaining and this enables them work in more than one shops or companies that are especially close to each other. So depending on their bargaining power it is possible that some Maasai [migrants] can earn up to Tsh 500,000/= (Euro 250) monthly; when they put together the whole amount. An important missing aspect is lack of education among the as so many of them don't know how to read and write leave alone possessing professional skills! This remarkably reduces their job and salary bargaining powers. **(Male key informant, 36, Dar es Salaam)**

The problem with my relatives [the Maasai] cannot speak the language [Swahili]. So how can they be able to negotiate better pay or requesting for job contract with aMswahili [noon Maasai and employers]; yet they don't know how to speak the language? This is especially a big problem with my relatives [other Maasai] because they are used to only speaking the (Ki) Maasai. **(Male Migrant youth (29) Dar es Salaam)**

Further, migrants capacity to cope with labour exploitation was impeded by the lack of formal skills and education e.g. ability to read, write and complete simple arithmetic, significantly impeded the migrants

capacity to cope with labour exploitation threat and its associated problems such as low wages and financial, constraint sat individual level. Indeed, only 60 percent of the interviewed Maasai migrants had attained primary education, 34 percent did not have education at all and 6 percent had post primary education and professional skills, namely metal welding, carpentry and mechanics, although they were not working in their respective professions. These factors have also been previously found to be critical in coping with inadequate finance and employment constraints {May 2003 #14}{Drinkwater 2010 #45}.

“The boss [employer] does not want to give us the job contract because he knows that we can leave at any time and so if he gives us the contract it is going to be a kind of disturbance. If you remind him about it he becomes very bitter with you”.(Male Maasai migrant youth (24), Dar es Salaam)

Migrants could not solicit financial support at the meso level organisations like NGOs, financial institutions such as Banks and SACCOs in case they wanted support such as loans. This was mainly due to irrational fear of the institutions; being unaware of the existence of such support, bureaucracy and inability to organize themselves to access it.

There are [practically] no [financial] institutions that we can turn to for financial support. We’re also afraid of going to Banks [SACCOS] to get loans because they require a lot of details [IDs, filling in applications etc]. So what are all these explanations for? If I turn to my fellow Maasai or a friend there will be no need for all this kind of chain of explanations or complication. **(Male Maasai migrant youth (30), Dar es Salaam)**

Secondly, migrants could hardly solicit financial support from meso level organisations such as banks and SACCOS due to lack of collaterals and physical address as required by those institutions and attested by these testimonies:

I can’t bother myself seeking for financial assistance from banks or SACCOS simply because I don’t have anything to give them as a security against the loan I may need. Also, I don’t have time to go through all the bureaucratic procedures. What I normally do is to save a bit of what I earn [for my future] and also consult my friends and relatives whenever I have a financial problem **(Male Maasai migrant youth (28), Dar es Salaam)**

“....., may be they can go to banks for loans, but most of them will not qualify [for loans] because of their lack of adequate income and (.....) Permanent settlement [physical address], bankers cannot give money to people without permanent settlement... it is like throwing away money” **(Male Key informant (37), Dar es Salaam)**

You can’t lend money to someone who doesn’t have a physical address (...). It is dangerous as it amounts to throwing money away (...). You can hardly deal with someone who doesn’t have a specific physical address as tracing the loan becomes extremely cumbersome. Most of these people [the Maasai migrants] don’t have well established settlements here in the city. How do you expect them to benefit from us? **(Male key informant (37) Dar es Salaam)**

Conclusion and policy outlook

Conclusively this paper has examined labour exploitation threats faced by the migrants, to determine the migrants’ capacities to cope with threats and propose factors for enhancing migrants’ capacities to more competently cope with the threats. Accordingly forms of labour exploitation threat experienced by the migrants include low wages and financial constraints, various forms of economic exploitation and oppression, communication barrier among others. As discussed, migrants managed to solicit support

from various social layers to develop mainly reactive and to a lesser degree proactive capacities towards coping with the threats.

To cope with the low wages and financial constraints migrants engaged in multiple income earning activities, spent less money on the less important needs, engaged in cheap shopping as well as demonstrating their exotic culture to maintain uniqueness in the labour market. Proactively, the migrants recognised and invested on their cultural wealth. However, the capacity to cope was impeded by their lack of formal education and language proficiency. Consequently, migrants proactively invested in their own and their children's education and language skills.

Interestingly, migrants also managed to draw financial support on their local households' but also proactively invested in those resources as future ways of maintaining financial security.

Proactively, migrants invested on various entrepreneurship activities e.g. hair dressing to alleviate low wages and maintain future financial security. Moreover, migrants engaged in sharing of resources and services e.g. accommodation but also collectively engaging in different cultural activities notably traditional dances for entertainment and fundraising purposes. Additionally, migrants formed and drew financial support on their solidarity groups.

However, migrants were incapable of soliciting financial support from meso level structures such as NGOs, financial institutions such as Banks and SACCOs, due to irrational fear, lack of awareness, bureaucracy, lack of collaterals and physical address. Equally, migrants did not secure any financial support from national level structures due to bureaucracy, lack of awareness about them and because they were not listened to whenever they went there.

To cope with the various forms of economic exploitation and oppression threat, migrants constantly bargained and negotiated with employers on fair and timely remuneration, together with arbitrary and timely payment of salary deduction. However, migrants' struggles to negotiate were hampered by their lack of knowledge on labour rights, job contracts, and Swahili language proficiency.

Proactively speaking migrants intended to form advocacy groups that would help them to continuously bargain and remind the employers of their fair remuneration and other employment benefits.

However, migrants were incapable of drawing support from meso level relating to overcoming various forms of exploitation and oppression because only one meso level relevant organisation (NGOs) existed; besides it was ill-equipped in terms of resources. Likewise, migrants managed to solicit extremely little or not at all any support from national level due to corrupt practices, migrants' fear of and little knowledge about existing government structures.

In coping with crime migrants utilised mainly local knowledge and physical strength notably running away, hiding and changing of the attires and used mobile phones to call employers, friends or police to rescue them once attacked. When all these did not work, migrants quitted security jobs. However, in some cases migrants were incapable of using mobile phones due to lack of knowledge on phones, lack of air time and being unaware of important telephone numbers.

Proactively, migrants looked forward to finding other much safer jobs and investment in their children's education, as well as developing their knowledge and skills in providing security services. However, migrants lacked effective security equipment and training.

At community level migrants engaged in security work in groups and not mixing up with non Maasai people as could be potential enemies. However, at meso level migrants could not solicit ant-crime support e.g. security skills, information and equipment as such organisations did not exist.

Finally, in order to cope with communication barrier resulting from the inadequate language proficiency the migrants learned language and intended to invest in their own and their children's education.

The theoretical implications

Turning to the theoretical implications regarding this study it could be said that this study is incapable of producing a robust resilience implication regarding informal sector-related threats facing the Maasai migrants. This is because, the study is a small scale qualitative one, consisting of a mere sample of 64 respondents.

Another theoretical implication concerns the theoretical framework used in this paper. It can be said that, compared to the assets in the sustainable livelihood framework of the UK Department for International Development {DfID 2000 #44}capitals in the multi-layered social resilience framework of {Obrist 2010 #37}tended to be too broad, proving relatively laborious in clearly operationalising them into the context of this study.

Nevertheless, generally speaking, the multi-layered social resilience framework {DfID 2000 #44}proved useful in understanding the resilience building process against different informal sector-related threats experienced by the Maasai migrants.

Structuring the work around the capitals and various social layers facilitated the report writing task and identification of the specific capitals that were more critical in fostering resilience building process against a certain threat.

Secondly, narrowing the definition of threats sharpened the analysis scope, making it possible to capture specific threats and coping capacities thus, moving beyond the Sustainable Livelihood Framework of the {Coast 2006 #47} that puts more emphasis on capitals or entitlements necessary for coping with a threat and less emphasis on the threat itself.

The multi-layered nature of the framework made it possible to capture migrants' capacities to cope with the threats by drawing on capitals not only from individual but also community, meso, national and international levels. This puts these findings ahead of other former authors notably {Coast 2006 #47}{May 2003 #14}{May 2007 #15}{Ole Kaunga 2007 #19},who have focused mainly on the individual and household's levels while examining the Maasai migrants' capacities to cope with urban threats.

Furthermore, use of the strength based approach as emphasised by the multi-layered social resilience framework enabled the author to explore migrants' personal resourcefulness without necessarily

regarding them as passive victims of threats but individuals who have their own ways of coping with threats. This puts the framework ahead of other frameworks such as the vulnerability model that considers resilience process as merely a function of risk/ threat and defencelessness to cope {Turner 2003 #36}. For example, it was noted that Maasai culture is not only a liability for migrants as widely asserted by communities in Tanzania, but rather an asset necessary for coping with financial constraints, unemployment and crime threats. Finally, defining and using “proactive capacity” enabled the researcher to specifically capture and understand the extent to which migrants had learned and reflected on the specific threats, thus organising themselves much better in coping with such threats in the future.

Policy implications

Owing to the preceding findings and discussion, this paper outlines the following recommendations aimed at improving the resilience of the Maasai migrants in coping with various forms of labour exploitation threat.

Firstly, migrants’ local knowledge and skills notably security, hair braiding, and herbs selling skills should be recognised and enhanced accordingly so as it can improve their bargaining power and income. Migrants should be provided with and sensitized on practical and professional skills such as literacy and simple arithmetic; entrepreneurship skills to enable them manage their entrepreneurship activities and acquire financial assistance from financial institutions, acquire decent jobs, thus minimising their chances of falling victims to financial constraints, unemployment, exploitation and oppression.

Maasai youth should be sensitized on the existing public and private institutions in order that they can effectively make use of them in coping with the aforementioned threats. They include financial institutions such as banks and SACCOS and NGOs, and government agencies e.g. the police. Specifically, migrants should be made aware of human and labour rights particularly those ones related to the importance of job contracts to help them overcome threats of job termination, overworking, salary delay and deductions.

Conclusively it can be said that Maasai migrants’ workers managed to draw support mainly, from individual and household levels, to develop reactive and to a lesser extent proactive capacities to cope with various threats of informal sector activities. However, more potential could be tapped from meso, national and international levels to support the migrants to more competently cope with the threats. In this case migrants’ competence against the threats could be more improved through the amelioration of formal skills and rendering the existing meso, national, and international institutions more responsive towards the threats.